

10-2019

## **Review of Valley of the Guns: The Pleasant Valley War and the Trauma of Violence, by Eduardo Obregón Pagán**

Jamie Starling

*The University of Texas Rio Grande Valley*, [jamie.starling@utrgv.edu](mailto:jamie.starling@utrgv.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: [https://scholarworks.utrgv.edu/hist\\_fac](https://scholarworks.utrgv.edu/hist_fac)



Part of the [History Commons](#)

---

### **Recommended Citation**

Starling, Jamie. Review of Valley of the Guns: The Pleasant Valley War and the Trauma of Violence, by Eduardo Obregón Pagán. *Southwestern Historical Quarterly* 123, no. 2 (2019): 245-247. doi:10.1353/swh.2019.0091.

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Liberal Arts at ScholarWorks @ UTRGV. It has been accepted for inclusion in History Faculty Publications and Presentations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks @ UTRGV. For more information, please contact [justin.white@utrgv.edu](mailto:justin.white@utrgv.edu), [william.flores01@utrgv.edu](mailto:william.flores01@utrgv.edu).

States and Mexico. Schulze argues that it is partly for this reason that, by the middle of the twentieth century, there were significant disparities between O'odham in Mexico and the United States. With protected reservations in Arizona but only a small amount of vulnerable ejido land in Sonora, Sonoran O'odham migrated into Arizona or into Sonoran cities where "the lines separating all of their communities from Mexican communities would only continue to blur" (142).

Schulze's final chapter first reviews U.S. Indian policy from pivotal Cherokee cases in the 1830s through a series of reforms from the 1970s through the 1990s. He suggests that the U.S. government demonstrated "a great deal of flexibility" with Yaquis and Kickapoos, who in his view fell short of federal guidelines "by a longshot" (175). Nevertheless, like Rensink, he argues that the timing was right to make bids for tribal recognition, which Schulze views as a significant step in establishing "nationhood." Schulze makes a significant error when he claims that the Pascua Yaquis never obtained recognition as a "historic tribe," when in fact, as Rensink correctly indicates, they did so in 1994. Moreover, Schulze's statement that nationhood is "in the eye of the beholder" (10) remains somewhat unsatisfying. Without a clearer definition, how is it a useful concept for studying and comprehending different forms of human organization? How does such a vague definition allow us to study the rise of nation-states and nationalism around the world?

Nevertheless, both of these books are most welcome additions to an ever-growing body of scholarship on borderlands and Indigenous peoples. They are highly significant contributions to a much smaller body of comparative studies, moving us toward a better understanding of how national borders have impacted Native populations; how Indian policies developed on distinct paths in different nations, with serious implications for Native peoples; how Indigenous groups ultimately played a role in constructing national borders both by crossing them and by using them to their own advantage; and how Indigenous groups built their own communities and "nations" in borderland contexts.

*Northern Arizona University*

ERIC V. MEEKS

*Valley of the Guns: The Pleasant Valley War and the Trauma of Violence.* By Eduardo Obregón Pagán. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2018. Pp. 312. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index.)

At first glance, the Pleasant Valley War that occurred in central Arizona from 1881 to 1892 represents an archetypal frontier conflict of that era. In this engaging book, Eduardo Obregón Pagán recovers this history from familiar western tropes and popular mythmaking with a thor-

oughly researched study that draws theoretical inspiration from recent scholarship on the North American borderlands. In particular, the author acknowledges the influence of Ned Blackhawk's acclaimed book *Violence over the Land* (Harvard University Press, 2006) for providing a framework for understanding how conflicts that appear to stem from personal feuds tie peoples and communities to "imperial" networks. Pleasant Valley's setting in the historic "theft corridor" of trading and raiding that extended from northern Mexican mines and presidios across the Apache lands to the Great Basin is especially significant as a background to this history. Pagán also highlights the diverse origins of the settlers who arrived in the region during the 1870s, including Protestants and Mormons, the Blevins Gang of Texas, and the Tewkesbury boys, a prominent mixed white-Native American family from California who were central participants in the war.

Texas cowboys often found a cold welcome from fellow settlers who saw many arrivals from the Lone Star State, including the Blevins clan, as "desperadoes." Far from seeing all stockmen as intrepid frontiersmen, more civic-minded residents of territorial Arizona often condemned cowboys as "white Indians," rootless, vice-ridden thieves on horseback who lived fast and died young" (48). While the author focuses on a small and relatively thinly populated part of Arizona, many patterns familiar to historians of Texas during this period are evident in Pleasant Valley. Among these themes are conflicts between farmers and ranchers, rivalry among sheepherders and cattlemen, and tensions between formal and informal means of resolving disputes. This study also illustrates how the later phases of conflict between American Indians and settlers immediately involved the conquest of land, but also led to the destruction of a robust Indigenous trade network across the American West. Moreover, Pagán frequently alludes to the destabilizing effect that the constant fear of a sudden attack had on life in frontier Arizona (55).

While Pagán revises older narratives on the Pleasant Valley War and engages the latest scholarship on the American West, he also aims for a broad audience beyond fellow scholars. His prose is clear and richly descriptive in a style that might appeal to enthusiasts of classic western novels as well as academic monographs. At times, Pagán uses contemporary accounts from Arizona newspapers as well as later interviews of survivors to recreate dialogues and actions meticulously from sources such as oral histories and newspaper accounts. This overt awareness of the power of storytelling to inform myths and their scholarly correctives is a major theme that runs through *Valley of the Guns*. Above all, Pagán poses interesting questions about the nature of violence and how a climate of fear and the growth of distrust can rapidly shatter the peace of any community. And despite the specific geographic focus, Pagán is mindful of the threads that tie the violence of "Pleasant Valley" to the wider process of conquest and economic change that marked the greater Southwest after 1848. As

such, this book stands as a strong addition to other recent works on violence and trauma in the Southwest borderlands.

*University of Texas Rio Grande Valley*

JAMIE STARLING

*Color Coded: Party Politics in the American West, 1950–2016.* By Walter Nugent. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2018. Pp. 384. Notes, bibliography, index, illustrations, tables.)

As Walter Nugent observes in this extensive study on modern politics in the American West, “Politics has always been colorful” (3). The author takes a systematic look at the nineteen states now considered to be the western region of the nation, examining historical events, social change, personalities, and issues that shaped the West from 1950 through 2016. As part of this “colorful” narrative, the study examines how these states have emerged as red (Republican), blue (Democratic), or purple (alternating red and blue).

This book examines states from the Midwest, Southwest, and the West, including the states defined as western by the U.S. Census Bureau as well as the states from North Dakota to Texas, plus Alaska and Hawaii. As the two largest (in terms of population), Texas and California play a major role as among the most diverse and politically influential states in the region, despite having taken different paths after World War II. Texas, once recognized as part of the Old South coalition and reliably Democratic for the first half of the twentieth century, shifted to a Republican majority and domination by 2000, while California became a blue bedrock of the Democratic Party by the twenty-first century.

Nugent’s well-written and organized work makes extensive use of secondary and primary sources that include newspapers, oral histories, election returns, and numerous archival sources. The narrative covers major political and social milestones as well as engaging stories of well-known elected officials. The book contains reference to significant histories, movements, and individuals, including presidents, members of Congress, and civic, religious, and business leaders. The author sites many relevant examples in his analysis that demonstrate his comprehensive understanding of the issues and trends that influence politics and elections.

Although Texas Republicans began to win office in the 1950s, the state effectively started to become a two-party state in the 1970s. The old Democratic leadership of Lyndon Johnson and Sam Rayburn had passed on. Ralph Yarborough lost his Senate seat in the 1970 Democratic Primary to Lloyd Bentsen. Republicans began making inroads by winning congressional and legislative seats, judicial contests, and breaking up the long-standing Democratic hold on county courthouses around the state. As an example of change, the governorship rotated among Republican Gover-