

2-2020

Bilingual Teacher Educators at an HSI: A Border Pedagogy for Latinx Teacher Development

Alcione N. Ostorga

The University of Texas Rio Grande Valley, alcione.ostorga@utrgv.edu

Christian E. Zuniga

The University of Texas Rio Grande Valley

Kip Austin Hinton

The University of Texas Rio Grande Valley

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.utrgv.edu/bls_fac



Part of the [Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons](#), [Modern Languages Commons](#), and the [Other Languages, Societies, and Cultures Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Ostorga, A. N., Zuniga, C. E., & Hinton, K. A. (2020). Teacher Education at Hispanic-Serving Institutions. In *Bilingual Teacher Educators at an HSI : A Border Pedagogy for Latinx Teacher Development* (pp. 137–155). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429198564-10>

This Book is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Education and P-16 Integration at ScholarWorks @ UTRGV. It has been accepted for inclusion in Bilingual and Literacy Studies Faculty Publications and Presentations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks @ UTRGV. For more information, please contact justin.white@utrgv.edu, william.flores01@utrgv.edu.

Bilingual Teacher Educators at an HSI: A Border Pedagogy for Latinx Teacher Development

Alcione N. Ostorga, Christian E. Zúñiga & Kip Austin Hinton

Introduction

The U.S. borderlands are a unique geopolitical space that requires context specific pedagogies (Reza-Lopez, Charles & Reyes, 2014), such as specific practices for strengthening academic and linguistic readiness (Flores, et al, 2007; Guerrero and Guerrero, 2017), and for developing a critical consciousness, to ensure educational quality (Ostorga, & Farruggio, 2018). As we develop these special pedagogies, it is important for us to consider the specific diversities of our communities within our border context. The Rio Grande Valley (RGV) is a fast-growing area spanning four counties along the northern margin of the Rio Grande. Most unique to our region is the fluidity of its border with Mexico, where bilingualism and biculturalism are common and where living often spans across two countries, as people commute to work, visit families or shop. Our Latinx¹ student population consists mostly of U.S. born Mexican Americans, Mexican immigrants, and transnational students with daily commutes between the U.S. and Mexico. These aspects of our students' lives interact with their identity development in unique ways. Therefore, we aim to develop pedagogies for promoting professional growth in our Preservice Teachers (PTs) based on the specific contextual factors of our region, and other regions along the U.S. southern border.

As a borderlands' institution, we are developing a mission and vision for our HSI identity in the college of education, as well as in our university. We envision pedagogical practices embedded in our teacher preparation that are context specific to our bilingual, biliterate, and bicultural community; one

¹ The inclusive term Latinx, comprising multiple cultures, races and ethnicities who either originated or descended from Latin America, is the term used in this chapter, instead of Hispanic.

that not only prepares PTs to effectively teach all students, but also promotes strong values for equity and social justice. For our Latinx PTs, this aim has two purposes: 1) to tailor our educational practices capitalizing on their unique strengths and addressing possible challenges in their professional development, and 2) preparing them to successfully promote their students' academic achievement through rigorous, culturally appropriate and sustainable practices (Paris, 2012).

We draw on a growing body of seminal work in Latinx teacher preparation to theorize a set of border pedagogies for our context. These represent specific pedagogies that foster the development of Latinx teachers who are knowledgeable of the appropriate teaching practices for all types of students. Furthermore, we pursue practices that can help our students develop into advocates for social justice, aware of the many social and political forces impacting the schools where they will serve. These specific practices should take into consideration the specific cultural and professional identities of our preservice teachers. As a special interest research group within our college, aiming to develop an HSI identity that is context-based, we engaged in a meta-synthesis of professional literature that includes empirical research and theoretical work about the preparation of Latinx PTs in our border region. We foresee the application of these pedagogies for other regions where Latinx PTs can benefit; and envision furthering our research in the future, to explore metaphorical borders, including Latinx PTs' hybrid transcultural identities outside our geographical border.

The Need for Border Pedagogies in Latinx Teacher Preparation

Although our region is unique, there is a significant shortage of teachers from minoritized populations nationwide. In the state of Texas, white children already make up less than half of the school-age population; non-white children constitute a growing majority in cities across Texas, and in much of the U.S. (Mordechay & Orfield, 2017). Though these statistical trends are more drastic in Texas, due

perhaps to its size and proximity to the border, only 27% of the teaching workforce in the state is Latinx. (Parker, 2018). Nationwide, the number is even more alarming as Latinx teachers make up only 9.2% of the teaching workforce. The implication, then, is that we have a growing need for a body of knowledge that focuses on Latinx teacher preparation to address the growing population of Latinx K-12 students.

In the RGV, the demographics are quite different from the rest of state and the nation, with Latinx representing 97% of students and 89% of the teachers (RGV Focus, 2019). Because, our PTs come from the local communities and will return as teachers upon certification, this has huge implications for our role in the transformation of education for all children in the area. As a Hispanic Serving Institution in the RGV, we believe we are in a position to make significant contributions in the area of Latinx teacher preparation by developing border pedagogies that specifically fit the social, historical and cultural context of the Rio Grande Valley.

Within our context, particular concerns are related to the effects of subtractive schooling (Valenzuela, 2004) and hegemonic practices that impacted the identity and academic development of our PTs during their P-12 education. For example, Flores and Riojas (1997) documented issues related to the high incidence of failure in certification exams among minority PTs in the state of Texas. This continues to be an area of concern today. Significant concerns documented pertain the Spanish proficiency test required for the certification of bilingual teachers (Guerrero and Guerrero 2017). Other areas of concern include promoting critical awareness, deconstructing the effects of hegemonic practices preservice teachers experienced through schooling (Ostorga & Farruggio, 2018) , and developing advocacy and agency (Palmer, 2018) .

Across time, research in teacher preparation demonstrates that the ultimate goal has been to promote student success by teaching research-based practices. Thus, teacher preparation has focused on educating PTs about pedagogy, or the most effective methods for their instructional practices. In

addition, PT preparation includes knowledge of the various content areas that students must learn. Thus, the body of research has led to specific approaches in teacher preparation, such as the implementation of high leverage practices (Ball, Sleep, & Boerst, 2009), development of a critical reflective stance (Brookfield, 2017), and teacher inquiry (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2009), to name a few. Yet, the body of knowledge on teacher preparation tends to assume a "one-size-fits-all" approach anchored in monolingual English, white, middle class contexts (Ladson-Billings, 2005).

Though the term *Border Pedagogies for Teacher Development* has not been used directly by other scholars in the field, there is nevertheless, an emerging focus in investigating practices for Latinx teachers. For example, we see this trend in the works of scholars at other HSI universities, such as the University of Texas (UT) at San Antonio (Flores et al., 2007) and UT El Paso (Reza-Lopez, Huerta & Reyes, 2014), as well as at UT Rio Grande Valley (Guerrero & Guerrero, 2017; Ostorga & Farruggio, 2014; Rodriguez, & Musanti, 2014). Research in this area has also been conducted beyond the state of Texas, such as the work of Garrity et al. (2016) and Wong, Athanases, and Banes (2017) in California. The emergence of this focus across different geographical areas points to the need for a coherent investigation in order to develop these appropriate pedagogies for Latinx PTs.

Our Research Journey

Our journey begins with who we are within this context. We combine our three different perspectives as:

- a native Portuguese speaker from Brazil, who immigrated to the U.S during adolescence, experiencing English immersion and culture shock,
- a Latina, RGV native with simultaneous bilingual development and,
- a white native English speaker, not born in a border state, who learned Spanish as a teenager.

Our process can be best understood as an organic grounded theory approach (Charmaz, 2006) where the field of educator preparation for Latinx PTs was a setting to be explored so that we could develop an understanding of the ways and means developed by these future practitioners. If we envision the entire field of teacher preparation for Latinx as the research setting, and the published work as our data, we can then understand the need to examine all types of evidence to decipher the pedagogies developed and the reasoning behind their development. For our purposes this includes empirical and theoretical works. Given our individual experiences and our awareness of how life experiences impacted our own identity development, along with the ample research to support this awareness, (Achugar, 2006; Haddix, 2010; Varghese et al., 2005), we can conclude that professional identity development is not just based on broad principles for all preservice teachers. Instead, we must, also consider the contextual mitigating factors (CMFs) (Gallard Martinez et al., 2018) that contribute to our PTs' formation. CMFs refer to the "...set of socio-historical-political contextual constructs..., simultaneously interweaving community, education, family, gender/identity, and other socially constructed domains." (p. 3). Important CMFs to consider in PTs development may include their experiences in schooling and their cultural and linguistic development, as they often come from a cultural and linguistic background that is different from the majority culture and language experienced in schools.

Based on these ideas, and with the intent of building on the research of others who have worked with similar populations, , we decided to investigate peer-reviewed empirical studies that examined the challenges and opportunities encountered in the preparation of Latinx PTs. We were aware that being of an exploratory nature, most of these studies would make use of qualitative methodologies. Therefore, before actually engaging in the literature review, with the intentions of being systematic, we first explored specific methods available to us and found that meta-analysis of qualitative research would be our best choice at this initial stage. This exploration represented our act of studying the map for our

journey, so we identified mentor texts (Ke, 2009; Relic et al., 2015) that might help guide our literature analysis. This step was particularly helpful in guiding us toward a systematic process of identification and selection of studies in our meta-analysis. We made conscious decisions about the search engines and the specific terms used in our searches. We used a total of 70 search terms in six categories, which included, identity/demographics, geographic location, teacher education, labels of bilingual students, P-12 programs and other concepts. (see Table 1). Then, we narrowed our search to empirical work focused on teacher preparation at the pre-service level within the four U.S.-Mexico border states based on the unique contextual factors present in the borderlands. As we progressed in the investigation, we also searched for the appropriate studies referenced in the original articles we examined. Our initial compilation consisted of 84 publications. Yet, our studied body of work expanded to include three edited works (Guerrero et al., 2017, Flores, Sheets & Clark, 2010 and Ramirez, Faltis & Dejong, 2018), some of which was published during our investigation.

Insert Table 1 here

Among the relevant publications, we also found work that was theoretical in nature. Although these publications were not reporting the results of specific empirical work, they synthesized an extensive body of research on converging areas that impact the identity formation, ideologies and professional formation of Latinx PTs. These often provided a foundation for much of the research that was being conducted (Palmer & Martinez, 2013; Flores, Sheets & Clark, 2010; and Reza-Lopez, Charles & Reyes, 2011). Furthermore, we realized that our work was moving beyond a mere meta-analysis to summarize findings. Instead, we discovered the need to synthesize a whole body of knowledge and felt compelled to include theoretical work, as well as the analysis of empirical work, to develop a theory of border pedagogies for teacher preparation. Our emerging theory was founded on the last 30+ years of teacher education work with Latinx PTs. For example, the work of Flores, Sheets and Clark (2011), an

edited volume, presented a synthesis of much of the research conducted at the University of Texas San Antonio, of which 8 studies are included in our meta-analysis. Also, included was an article by Reza-Lopez, Charles and Reyes (2014), which synthesizes works of Anzaldua and Freire, among others, to explain what they call a Nepantlera pedagogy. Their synthesis illuminates theoretical concepts used by other researchers in our analysis, such as Caldas Chumbes (2016) Rodriguez & Musanti (2014) and Sarmiento-Arribalzaga & Murrillo (2010). We therefore needed more than a simple meta-analysis of qualitative research in our theorizing process and discovered Sandelowski and Barroso's (2006) model for meta-synthesis of qualitative research. Though systematic and worthy as a method for a meta-synthesis of qualitative work, we found it was too limiting for our purposes because if strictly followed, it would lead us to exclude the significant work, as explained above, that should be included in our research to get a more comprehensive picture of the border pedagogies developed. Therefore, as we shifted our research approach and explored the possibility of using a meta-synthesis methodology, we further expanded our method towards a different kind of meta-synthesis. Our meta-synthesis, which is fully explained by Hinton, Ostorga and Zúñiga (in press) includes theoretical, qualitative and quantitative studies to synthesize and build a more complete understanding of the pedagogies developed by others, and to create a formal theory based on the current body of knowledge on this topic, a theory of *Border Pedagogies for Teacher Development*. For the purposes of this chapter, we focus here only on our analysis of the empirical work.

Our analytical process led to the discovery of emergent themes among the studies and relationships among them, as well as an examination of our positionalities as participant researchers within the context of teacher preparation along this border community. As we analyzed the different publications through our bi-weekly conversations, we discovered that teacher education faculty and preservice teachers are players within different micro contexts: 1) the P-12 school system where PTs attended and

will return upon graduation, 2) the local communities, and 3) the university-based teacher preparation program. (see Figure 1). In turn, these micro contexts interact with the macro sociopolitical/educational context of which they are a part. As teacher educators, many of us have been the products of educational contexts similar to the educational context in which our PTs will exercise their professional practices. Yet, many teacher educators are not familiar with the CMFs that have impacted our PTs, and they should engage in experiential work at the local communities and local schools to become informed of these important factors in the identity formation of our PTs. Thus, in essence, university teacher preparation sits at the center of this cyclical journey in Latinx teacher preparation. Furthermore, the three stakeholders in this journey: students in P-12 schools, PTs who are future teachers, and teacher educators in an HSI within the border, live and engage with each other as they interact within the contextual sociopolitical setting of our society and our nation.

Insert Figure 1 here

The picture we present here attempts to illustrate the relationships among these multiple stakeholders and the multiplicity of factors in their journey, yet we realize that this picture is not linear but three-dimensional, with the relationships going in different directions. For example, our practices will impact the school setting in the future, as our PTs become teachers, but their practices are also impacted by their past experiences, when they were students in schools. Likewise, the sociopolitical context of schools influences our pedagogies as educators since we attempt to promote what we view as positive changes. We also tailor our practices based on our past experiences as students and our current knowledge of the forces acting upon the education of all children. Certainly, the diagram presented signifies our evolving view of the complexities of these intermingled forces and evolving pedagogies; knowledge of the forces

acting upon the education of all children. The diagram presented is a work in progress. And at this point in our study, we theorized the following elements and the relationships among them.

The emergent pedagogies for our context can be divided into four categories:

- Understanding and addressing contextual mitigating factors present in the context of the Borderlands
- Keeping students' cultures at the center of the teaching/learning process
- Maximizing Content knowledge (discipline specific instructional approaches related to math, science, & social studies knowledge)
- Maximizing Linguistic knowledge (development of the four language domains - oracy and literacy - in Spanish & English)

It is important to note that these categories are not isolated units but interact with each other in the development and application of the specific pedagogies. For example, in the study by Rodriguez and Musanti (2014), their developed pedagogies addressed both the maximization of content knowledge and linguistic knowledge since it used an instructional approach where language is taught through content. This fosters the development of English as a second language while promoting conceptualization of specific disciplines such as mathematics or science.

Addressing the Contextual Mitigating Factors to Foster Professional Readiness

This first category is at the heart of teacher educators' work with l=Latinx PTs as they facilitate the development of the teacher's professional identities. Some important elements identified by teacher educators in the professional formation of teachers are a critical reflective stance (Brookfield, 2017), a value for social justice, a strong inquiry stance (Cochran-Smith & Little, 2009), and teacher agency (Palmer & Martinez, 2013). Though content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge are crucial in

effective teaching practices, professional values and ideology ultimately are the forces that drive the teaching practice. This is why it is not enough to transmit the knowledge of the best teaching practices for future teachers, for we must also work towards the development of a professional identity. For Latinx PTs, this work includes awareness about their cultural identities, and the values and dispositions that lay at the foundation of their cultural selves, especially those values that may be in misalignment with the values from a majority culture. For example, the development of professional values that include an inquiry stance, or a willingness to engage in critical reflection, advocacy and agency are dependent on the self-identity of the teacher and in some ways, may be in opposition to the Latinx PTs' cultural values, which is made clear when we closely examine the process of identity formation.

Our understanding of the professional identity refers to how teachers define themselves, as professionals. We develop an identity by associating with particular groups, beliefs, and ways of being and by rejecting other values. Our individual identity is the nexus where we negotiate our different ways of being in the world. Thus, our professional practices emerge from our pedagogical knowledge as it interacts with our value systems (personal and professional) and our professional identities. Professional identities are continuously evolving (Flores & Day, 2006) concepts or images of self that strongly influence the way individuals develop as teachers. Therefore, we can understand that identity formation is the result a person's experiences across time and their responses to these experiences.

The professional identity is also woven with the cultural identity forged from personal values. This is a complex process when personal values come from a minority culture. In situating our work within the research about bilingual teacher preparation along border states, we find that our Latinx PTs have commonalities in the CMFs from experiences that have impacted the formation of their personal and cultural identities. Among the commonalities in their identity formation, that differs from PTs of

majority ethnicity, are bilingualism, biculturalism and the sociopolitical context they experience as members of a minority ethnicity, among others.

Bilingualism and Biculturalism in identity Formation

During their early school experiences in the US, many PTs in bilingual education programs across the southern border states, experienced transitional bilingual education. In this subtractive approach (Valenzuela, 2004), students are rushed out of bilingual education as early as possible and into English immersion programs where they are subject to losing their native language, and likely to fail to succeed academically compared with their monolingual, native English-speaking peers. (National Center for Education Statistics, 2013). In addition, they often learn to devalue their language and culture (Sarmiento-Arribalzaga & Murrillo, 2010), a stance that is in opposition to teacher preparation for additive bilingualism and social justice. Furthermore, due to the social context of schooling and society in general, when Latinx PTs come into our programs, we find that they are not always aware of the forces that contributed to the social inequities they experienced.

In addition, unlike white American children raised on individualistic values and nurtured into becoming independent, as children, Latinx PTs were taught based on collectivist/familist values (Rinderle & Montoya, 2008) and are often taught to respect authority. This may be why Latinx PTs are not always ready to challenge traditional practices (Weisman and Hansen 2008) or engage in critical reflection, which requires them to question the status quo for the benefit of their students because these behaviors are in opposition to their values, especially since as P-12 students they were typically not engaged in critical thinking and were expected to be generally submissive in the classroom settings.

Also, agency is an important stance for teachers who work with minoritized populations, especially emergent bilinguals (EBs). They must be in a position to challenge the practices imposed and base their decisions on their own data and a professional knowledge that combines research with

personal insight into the contextual factors that impact learning. The achievement gap between white and Hispanic students has persisted across the last three decades (U.S. Department of Education, 2015) despite educational policies which were supposedly created to dismantle the statistical gap. Latinx PTs must be able to bring their unique perspectives, critically examining the school practices and the outcomes, and seek to innovate these practices to address their students' needs and talents. Specific pedagogies for Latinx PTs therefore, must aim to promote their professional development by facilitating in them the complex process of identity reconstruction (Torres & Baxter-Magolda, 2004); one that helps them to make sense of their interweaving cultural and professional identities, preparing them to engage in teacher agency and advocacy for their students.

This category of studies identifies pedagogies to address CMFs particular to the border region and is unique to the preparation of Latinx teachers who have experienced schooling in bilingual and bicultural settings. This is the area most investigated in the studies we examined, though many of them only identified CMFs without actually developing the appropriate practices to address them.

Among the challenges resulting from CMFs identified in the reviewed studies were the need for cultural relevancy (Banes, et al., 2015; and Wong, Athanases and Banes, 2017). Other studies identified the presence of contradictory discourses between family and school, which eventually led to the adoption of hegemonic school values (Aguilar, MacGillivray & Walker, 2003; Garrity et al., 2016). These responses to CMFs often impacted language ideologies that promote monolingualism and deficit views of self. Another response to CMFs was the silencing of contradictory discourses, which eventually led to feelings of inadequacy and fear of seeking help in school, which sometimes may lead to dropping out due to academic failure. A complete analysis of this category is beyond the purposes of this chapter. Instead we focus here on specific border pedagogies to address these and other CMFs experienced by Latinx PTs through their life experiences in a border context.

Among the border pedagogies developed in the empirical research we investigated, is the exposure to contradictions in the field and specific activities that allows PTs to examine tacit ideologies and to engage in critical analysis and self-reflexive assignments allowing them to reconstruct their identities to one that includes agency and advocacy. Exposure to contradictions were present in the work of Caldas-Chumbes (2016), and Ostorga and Farruggio (2014). Caldas-Chumbes taught a course where she made use of a drama-based activity called counter story-telling. In this activity, PTs were presented with narratives of seasoned bilingual teachers that exposed the challenges they faced in schools as they grappled with social inequities. The counter storytelling took place in the form of performances where PTs practiced their responses to the challenges they would face in the future. The contradictions lay in the discrepancies between professional knowledge imparted in their teacher preparation courses and the realities of the bilingual education school context. The preparation for the counter storytelling included the use of semi-structured conversations where the PTs explored their perceptions of themselves as advocates and their ideologies related to language. The learning activities also included opportunity for reflections where PTs experienced shifts in their ideology as demonstrated through the shifts in discourse. As explained by Caldas-Chumbes, this pedagogy has the "... potential to imprint in the body—as well as in the intellect—a developing political clarity." It merged counter storytelling and performance through Theater of the Oppressed as a pedagogy that "blurred the of lines between the lessons learned" from past experiences and the rehearsal of future stories that could represent a way to resist the subtractive practices in bilingual education.

These are among the border pedagogies developed to counteract the effects of CMFs in an overarching way. Other pedagogies to address CMFs will be specifically described in the next three sections of this chapter since they address CMFs by specifically maximizing content and linguistic knowledge, and by identifying practices that are culturally relevant and sustainable (Paris, 2012.)

Keeping culture at the center for Preservice teachers and their future students.

Integrating culture into the teaching and learning process is significant for both PTs and their future students. Given the diversity of student populations across our nation, this has been recognized as an important kind of knowledge for all teachers. Due to their cultural experiences and ethnic identity, Latinx can be resourceful in integrating culture into their teaching practices. One study by Tellez, (1997) demonstrates that during student teaching, PTs of Mexican American descent, found creative ways of infusing culture into their teaching despite the limitations imposed by prescribed curricula in the schools, demonstrating their special resourcefulness in keeping culture at the center to make teaching appropriate for their students.

An example of pedagogies for culturally relevant pedagogy for PTs and students was described in the work of Ostorga & Farruggio (2014). The program combined the use of structures that capitalized on the PTs cultural strengths. In their third semester in the program, PTs engaged in a summer library program for language minority students where they experienced the freedom to apply what they learned in their courses without the supervision of a mentor teacher, or the limitations of a school setting. They created thematic units based on the children's interests and cultures. The experience was followed by a regular student teaching semester. This combination of activities provided a stark contrast and exposure to contradictions leading them toward paradigm shifts and critical reflection similar to what occurred in the study by Caldas-Chumbes (2016). As part of the coursework, reflective assignments took place within a dialogical space where faculty and PTs had evolved together, learning from each other. The work included a pedagogy of *cariño* described by Bartolome (2008), a culturally relevant pedagogy for PTs who have been marginalized by their school experiences and who thrive in collaborative environments. This counter hegemonic pedagogy combines academic rigor and liberatory practices. The

PTs in this program became aware of the inequitable subtractive practices they had experienced and learned ways to develop their own practices for the benefit of their students.

Some of the pedagogies developed in programs described at the other categories also address the need for cultural relevancy such as, translanguaging practices to leverage linguistic repertoire in two languages, to further develop their linguistic abilities in Spanish (Musanti & Rodriguez, 2017). This study demonstrates that while linguistic connections are important for students' conceptualization in schools, they are also culturally relevant and especially significant for PTs who experienced the negative effects of CMFs as described in the previous section.

Practices for Maximizing Content Knowledge

In preparing teachers to lead their students to academic success, we should find effective ways of developing PTs' own knowledge of these disciplines, as well as the skills to teach them. There is a scarcity of studies in this area for Latinx PT's development. Notable research includes an examination of PTs ability to ask high order thinking questions in Language Arts and Mathematics (Diaz, et al.,2013), and Rodriguez and Musanti's (2014) work on language use during instruction. Their work combines instructional practices that teach language through content, and the use of translanguaging, where the first language becomes a resource to maximize the learning of content in a new language. The study by Diaz et al described areas that need to be addressed but did not specifically develop pedagogies to address these challenges. However, Rodriguez' and Musanti's work on translanguaging practices may be developed as a border pedagogy to promote linguistic development of both students and PTs. Obviously, there is a need for research to examine pedagogies for Latinx PTs that maximize content knowledge for all learners within our local borderlands' schools.

A fourth study (Flores et al., 2007) specifically addressed the need to maximize PTs success, through support for academic and professional development, including their knowledge of the disciplines. This border pedagogy developed at the University of Texas San Antonio created a multilevel system of support for students with one of the goals being specifically to maximize the quality of programing and the retention of PTs during their preparation and through induction for one year. The most significant component of this complex border pedagogy was the creation of the Academy for Teacher Excellence (ATE), which included five components, among them, the ATE Teacher Academy Learning Community (ATE -TALC) , which included faculty and peer support. The collaborative approach provided academic, emotional and professional support. The program demonstrated success in increasing recruitment and retention of PTs, as well as successful completion of their professional preparation. Evidently, this approach deserves a more in depth look so it can be duplicated at other HSIs to address similar challenges.

Pedagogies for Maximizing Linguistic Knowledge

This category, which includes oracy (listening and speaking) and literacy (reading and writing), though a goal for the preparation of all teachers, is differentiated for Latinx PTs, especially for those who will work with Latinx EB students. For them, linguistic knowledge is bilingual, including the (cross) linguistic knowledge of Spanish and English, along with the knowledge of bilingual development. Nine studies addressed this theme. We detail the most notable work in this category.

Specific pedagogies in this category included the work presented by Lopez & Assaf (2014). It consisted of a combination of field based and service-learning components in conjunction with coursework focused on literacy practices that included reading and writing for EBs. The field-based component allowed PTs to integrate theory to practice within a formal school setting in collaboration with a mentor teacher. Conversely, the service-learning component, which took place after school and

allowed PTs to experience the freedom to apply principles learned in the coursework, led to the development of generative knowledge (Ball et al., 2009), which is the teacher's ability to apply their professional knowledge and understandings to new situations.

Another pedagogy in this category was explained in the work of Milk (1999). The focus of this study was to analyze a specific course that integrated instructional methods for content and language taught in Spanish to both ESL and bilingual PTs. The language used in the course aimed to meet the differing Spanish language proficiency needs of both types of PTs, while also preparing them to implement content-based strategies for learning language. ESL specialists received an immersion experience in Spanish that provided them with meaningful experiences for their future practices. Bilingual education specialists were provided opportunities to enhance their proficiency in academic Spanish. The course included simulated classroom experiences with small group, content-based instruction using a heterogeneous collaborative learning approach. The findings in this study are inconclusive due to the short-term duration of the course during the summer term. Nevertheless, the results are promising, and further research may lead us to a meaningful pedagogy for our HSI context.

Another noteworthy border pedagogy was developed at the University of California, Davis, (Banes, et al, 2017) and focuses on the use of self- reflexive inquiry into language and culture. The study describes this border pedagogy as a key assignment in a course on Cultural Diversity and Education for PTs. Findings include the development of metalinguistic awareness, and the promotion of appropriate ideological clarity to shape their practices, which lead to agentic decision making aimed at meeting the needs of their students. Through the assignment, TCs learned to leverage their resources as multilingual individuals who make use of their experiences, to connect with students and develop responsive teaching.

Through our analysis, we found support for some of our own experiences in working with Latinx TCs within the RGV. These include the importance of understanding the sociopolitical context of the borderlands and developing the knowledge of students' languages and development – which need to be an integral part of the preparation of Latinx TCs -- in addition to the rigorous knowledge of the disciplines they will teach to their future students. Consequently, these teacher educators' practices must evolve through personal explorations of the educational context within the RGV communities, especially for those who did not grow up within the region. Then, we can consciously play our role as practitioners within the middle space between the school contexts that impacted our TCs and the school context that can be transformed by their practices when they graduate and become certified. Furthermore, this is how we teacher educators can engage in the practices that deconstruct the effects of the hegemonic practices TCs have experienced through schooling, so they can develop as strong advocates and critical pedagogues in the local schools and communities, as well as outside our region. Our analysis and theorizing process pointed to the following specific principles to be present in teacher preparation programs within HSIs:

- Include elements aimed at raising awareness of tacit ideologies, and socio-political contextual factors that impacted on the formation of their own identities,
- Build upon ethnic identity and a strong self-concept promoting the readiness to engage in agency and advocacy
- Provide support through university structures and learning communities with spaces for dialogue among faculty and students about the important issues in their developmental journey
- Include opportunities for maximizing linguistic development in Spanish and English

- Ensure that the resources and knowledge acquired can be sustained after graduation, perhaps through support structures during their first year as professionals.

Though we derived important knowledge from the synthesis of the work already conducted, we realize that our work is just beginning. There are many gaps to be addressed. For example, we still need to examine teacher preparation pedagogies for Latinx TCs outside our geographical border. Additionally, practices for the inclusion of culturally relevant instruction and for maximizing linguistic and academic success in all content areas still needs to be explored further. We invite teacher educators everywhere to join us as we seek the appropriate practices that transform education for Latinx students and teachers across our nation.

References

- Achugar, M. (2006). Writers on the borderlands: Constructing a bilingual identity in Southwest Texas. *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, 5(2), 97–122.
- Aguilar, J. A., MacGillivray, L., & Walker, N. T. (2003). Latina educators and school discourse: Dealing with tension on the path to success. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 2(2), 89–100.
- Ball, D. L., Sleep, L., Boerst, T. A., & Bass, H. (2009). Combining the development of practice and the practice of development in teacher education. *The Elementary School Journal*, 109(5), 458-474.
- Banes, L. C., Martínez, D. C., Athanases, S. Z., & Wong, J. W. (2016). Self-Reflexive Inquiry into Language Use and Beliefs: Toward More Expansive Language Ideologies. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 10(3), 168–187. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19313152.2016.1185906>
- Bartolomé, L. (2008). Authentic cariño and respect in minority education: The political and ideological dimensions of love. *International Journal of Critical Pedagogy*, 1(1), 1-17.
- Brookfield, S. D. (2017). *Becoming a critically reflective teacher*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Caldas Chumbes, B. G. (2016). *Performing the advocate bilingual teacher: drama-based interventions for future story-making*. (Doctoral Dissertation) University of Texas Austin.
- Charmaz, K. (2006). *Constructing Grounded Theory: A Practical Guide through Qualitative Analysis*. SAGE.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Lytle, S. L. (2009). *Inquiry as stance: Practitioner research for the next generation*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

- Diaz, Z., Whitacre, M., Esquierdo, J., & Ruiz-Escalante, J. (2013). Why did I ask that question? Bilingual/ESL Preservice Teachers' Insights. *International Journal of Instruction*, 6(2), 164–176.
- Flores, B. B., Clark, E. R., Claeys, L., & Villarreal, A. (2007). Academy for Teacher Excellence: Recruiting [i.e. Recruiting], Preparing, and Retaining Latino Teachers through Learning Communities. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 34(4), 53–69.
- Flores, M. A., & Day, C. (2006). Contexts which shape and reshape new teachers' identities: A multi-perspective study. *Teaching and teacher education*, 22(2), 219-232
- Flores, B. B., Sheets, R. H., & Clark, E. R. (Eds.). (2010). *Teacher Preparation for Bilingual Student Populations: Educar para Transformar* (1 edition). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Gallard Martínez, A. J. Pitts, W. B., Brkich, K. M., & de Robles, S. L. R. (2018). How does one recognize contextual mitigating factors (CMFs) as a basis to understand and arrive at better approaches to research designs? *Cultural Studies of Science Education*.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11422-018-9872-2>
- Garrity, S., Aquino-Sterling, C. R., Van Liew, C., & Day, A. (2016). Beliefs about bilingualism, bilingual education, and dual language development of early childhood preservice teachers raised in a Prop 227 environment. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–18.
- Guerrero, M. D., & Guerrero, M. C. (2017). *Abriendo brecha: Antología crítica sobre la educación bilingüe de doble inmersión*. (L. S.-G. and K. Escamilla, Ed.). Albuquerque, NM: Fuente Press.
- Guerrero, M. D., & Guerrero, M. C. (2017). Competing discourses of academic Spanish in the Texas-Mexico borderlands. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 40(1), 5–19.

- Haddix, M. (2010). No Longer on the Margins: Researching the Hybrid literate Identities of Black and Latina Preservice Teachers. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 45(2), 97–123.
- Hinton, K. A., Ostorga, A. N. and Zúñiga, C. E. (in press).
- Ke, F. (2009). A qualitative meta-analysis of computer games as learning tools. *Handbook of Research on Effective Electronic Gaming in Education*, 1, 1–32.
- Ladson-Billings, G. J. (2005). Is the Team All Right? Diversity and Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 56 (3), 229–234.
- López, M. M., & Assaf, L. C. (2014). Developing Deeper Understandings of Diversity: Service Learning and Field Experiences Combine for Generative Learning of Bilingual/ESL Preservice Teachers. In *Research on Preparing Preservice Teachers to Work Effectively with Emergent Bilinguals* (Vol. 21, pp. 31–57). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-368720140000021000>
- Milk, R. (1990). Preparing ESL and Bilingual Teachers for Changing Roles: Immersion for Teachers of LEP children. *TESOL Quarterly*, 24(3), 407–426.
- Mordechay, K., & Orfield, G. (2017). Demographic transformation in a policy vacuum: The changing face of US metropolitan society and challenges for public schools. *The Educational Forum* 81: 193-203).
- Musanti, S. I. ., & Rodríguez, A. D. . (2017). Translanguaging in bilingual teacher preparation: Exploring pre-service bilingual teachers’ academic writing. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 40(1), 38–54.
- National Center for Education Statistics (2018). *Characteristics of Public School Teachers*. Retrieved January 2, 2019, from https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/indicator_clr.asp

- National Center for Education Statistics (2013). Trends in academic progress 2012. Institute of Education Sciences U.S. Department of Education, Washington D.C.
- Ocasio, K. M. 2014. “Nuestro Camino: A Review of Literature Surrounding Latino Teacher Pipeline”. *Journal of Latinos in Education* 13 (4): 244-261.
- Ostorga, A. N., & Farruggio, P. (2014). Discovering Best Practices for Bilingual Teacher Preparation: A Pedagogy for the Border. In Y. Freeman & D. Freeman (Eds.), *Advances in Research on Teaching* (Vol. 21, pp. 113–136). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Palmer, D. K. (2018). Supporting Bilingual Teachers To Be Leaders for Social Change: “*I must create advocates for biliteracy.*” *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 12(3), 203–216.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/19313152.2018.1474063>
- Palmer, D., & Martinez, R. (2013). Teacher Agency in Bilingual Spaces: A fresh look at preparing teachers to education Latino/a children. *Review of Research in Education*, 37, 269–297.
- Paris, D. (2012). Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy: A Needed Change in Stance, Terminology, and Practice. *Educational Researcher*, 41(3), 93–97. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X12441244>
- Parker, C. (2018, June 26). Educator Reports and Data. Retrieved January 2, 2019, from https://tea.texas.gov/Reports_and_Data/Educator_Data/Educator_Reports_and_Data/
- Reljić, G., Ferring, D., & Martin, R. (2015). A Meta-Analysis on the effectiveness of bilingual programs in Europe. *Review of Educational Research*, 85(1), 92–128.
- RGV Focus (2019). *Teacher Landscape Data* - unpublished
- Reza-López, E., Huerta Charles, L., & Reyes, L. V. (2014). Nepantlera pedagogy: An axiological posture for preparing critically conscious teachers in the borderlands. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 13(2), 107-119.
- Shulman, L. (1987). Knowledge and teaching: Foundations of the new reform. *Harvard educational review*, 57(1), 1-23.

- Rinderle, S., & Montoya, D. (2008). Hispanic/Latino Identity Labels: An Examination of Cultural Values and Personal Experiences. *Howard Journal of Communications*, 19(2), 144–164.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10646170801990953>
- Rodríguez, A. D., & Musanti, S. I. (2014). Preparing Latina/o Bilingual Teachers to Teach Content in Spanish to Emergent Bilingual Students on the US-Mexico Border. In *Research on Preparing Preservice Teachers to Work Effectively with Emergent Bilinguals* (Vol. 21, pp. 201–232). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Sandelowski, M., & Barroso, J. (2006). *Handbook for Synthesizing Qualitative Research*. Springer Publishing Company.
- Sarmiento-Arribalzaga, M. A., & Murillo, L. A. (2010). Pre-Service Bilingual Teachers and Their Invisible Scars: Implications for Preparation Programs. *SRATE Journal*, 19(1), 61–69.
- Torres, V., & Baxter-Magolda, (2004). Reconstructing Latino Identity: The Influence of Cognitive Development on the Ethnic Identity Process of Latino Students. *Journal of College Student Development* 45. (3), 333-347.
- U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Statistics, National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP), various years, 2002-2015 Reading Assessments.
- Valenzuela, A. (2004). *Leaving Children Behind: How Texas Style Accountability Fails Latino Youth*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Varghese, M., Morgan, B., Johnston, B., & Johnson, K. A. (2005). Theorizing language teacher identity: Three perspectives and beyond. *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, 4(1), 21–44.
- Weisman, E., M., & Hansen, L.E. (2008.) “Student Teaching in Urban and Suburban Schools: Perspectives of Latino Preservice Teachers.” *Urban Education* 43 (3): 653-670

Wong, J. W., Athanases, S. Z., & Banes, L. C. (2017). Developing as an agentive bilingual teacher: self-reflexive and student-learning inquiry as teacher education resources. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–17.

Table 1

Identity/demographics 15	Geographic location 17	Teacher ed 11
Latino Latina Latinos Latinx Hispanic Chicano Chicana Mexican American Mexican Indigenous Native American	borderlands border Southwest Texas New Mexico Arizona California Tamaulipas Coahuila Nuevo León Chihuahua Sonora Baja California Norte	teacher education teacher preparation teacher training teacher certification teacher licensure educator preparation pre-service teacher teacher educator paraprofessional
<i>In Spanish:</i> mexicano mexicana indígena indio	<i>In Spanish:</i> frontera fronteras Neplanta Neplantera	<i>In Spanish:</i> normalista escuela normal
Labels of bilingual students 6	P-12 programs 12	Other concepts 9
Emergent bilinguals English Language Learners Limited English Proficient Spanish speakers Nahuatl	bilingual education dual language double immersion English as a Second Language English Language Development Mexican American Studies Chicano Studies Raza Studies tribal education	identity border pedagogy hybridity grow your own culturally relevant pedagogy culturally responsive funds of knowledge bilingualism Spanish
<i>In Spanish:</i> bilingüe	<i>In Spanish:</i> educación bilingüe intercultural bilingüe doble inmersión	

Figuer 1

